



Working together
www.rcis.ro

Revista de cercetare și intervenție socială

ISSN: 1583-3410 (print), ISSN: 1584-5397 (electronic)

Selected by coverage in Social Sciences Citation Index, ISI databases

EARLY CHILDCARE, MATERNAL EDUCATION AND FAMILY ORIGINS: DIFFERENCES IN COGNITIVE AND LINGUISTIC OUTCOMES THROUGHOUT CHILDHOOD

Daniela BULGARELLI, Paola MOLINA

Revista de cercetare și intervenție socială, 2016, vol. 52, pp. 5-25

The online version of this article can be found at:

www.rcis.ro, www.doaj.org and www.scopus.com

Published by:

Expert Projects Publishing House



On behalf of:

„Alexandru Ioan Cuza” University,

Department of Sociology and Social Work

and

Holt Romania Foundation

REVISTA DE CERCETARE SI INTERVENTIE SOCIALA

is indexed by ISI Thomson Reuters - Social Sciences Citation Index

(Sociology and Social Work Domains)



Early Childcare, Maternal Education and Family Origins: Differences in Cognitive and Linguistic Outcomes throughout Childhood

Daniela BULGARELLI¹, Paola MOLINA²

Abstract

Centre-based care in early childhood has been associated with better scores on linguistic and cognitive tests at later times. Nevertheless, there is no consensus about the stability of these effects across the preschool and primary school stages. Furthermore, no data about the effects of early care have been reported from the Italian context. Our study analysed the effects of early childcare, maternal education and parental origin (native versus foreign) on the cognitive and linguistic outcomes of pre-schoolers and pupils. The sample comprised 175 three- to ten-year-old children, from a large Northern Italian city. Children's non-verbal cognitive functioning and receptive language were assessed. Parents provided information about their own birthplace and level of education and about their child's birthplace and type of childcare received from 0 to 2 years. Analysis of the single effects of type of care, maternal education and parental origin on children's outcomes, showed differences only due to maternal education. When the interactions among these variables were explored, centre-based care appeared to play a protective role with respect to maternal education: differences due to maternal education were evident in children who had been in home-based care, but not in children who had been in centre-based care. Besides, home-based care appeared to play a protective role with respect to parental origin: children with two foreign parents displayed more advanced linguistic knowledge if they had spent their early years in the home. The importance of educational intervention and training for professionals to better support children's development will be discussed.

Keywords: crèche, immigrant status, language, cognitive functioning, type of care.

¹ University of Torino, Department of Psychology, Torino, ITALY. E-mail: daniela.bulgarelli@unito.it

² University of Torino, Department of Psychology, Torino, ITALY. E-mail: paola.molina@unito.it

Introduction

In early childhood, babies and toddlers can receive two main types of care: centre-based and home-based. In centre-based care, children experience living in a group setting with adults and peers, and routines, spaces and toys are organized with the management of a group of children in mind; moreover, the adults taking care of them are trained professionals. In home-based arrangements, children are more likely to be alone with adults or to share routines and toys with a very small number of other children, usually younger or older siblings (Musatti & Picchio, 2010). In these informal settings, caretakers are usually mothers, grandparents or non-professional baby-sitters (Koslowski, McLean, & Naumann, 2015).

The tendency to choose centre-based care is influenced by several factors, pertaining both to cultural and socio-political contexts (such as public dual-earner support, women's participation in the labour market, availability of day care centre; Krapf, 2014; Mamolo, Coppola, & Di Cesare, 2011; Morgan & Zippel, 2003) and to parents' characteristics (such as SES, occupational status, education and immigrant status). Some studies reported that immigrant status predicted lower utilization of centre-based care (Miller, Votruba-Drzal & Coley, 2013; Miller, Votruba-Drzal, Coley & Koury, 2014; Sammons, *et al.*, 2004; Turney & Kao, 2009; Zachrisson, Janson & Nørde, 2013), whereas other studies did not find this relationship (Kahn & Greenberg, 2010; Krapf, 2014). In the US context, parental region of origin and immigrant parents' proficiency in English were associated with centre-based care usage (Miller *et al.*, 2013). Maternal education predicted centre-based care usage in several countries: Norway (Zachrisson, *et al.*, 2013), Finland and West Germany (Krapf, 2014), Belgium (Vandenbroeck, De Visscher, Van Nuffel, & Ferla, 2008), UK (Sylva, Stein, Leach, Barnes & Malmberg, 2007), Italy (Del Boca, Locatelli & Vuri, 2005) and US (NICHD ECCRN, 1997b; 2006). Moreover, parents' values concerning their child's need for socialization and for a stimulating education and their own need to be supported in their parenting role can play a role as well (Grogan, 2012; Kim & Fram, 2009; Musatti & Picchio, 2010). Thus, the choice of type of childcare is affected by multiple variables, while the different types of childcare provide different educational experiences that can influence children's development.

The literature emphasizes that type of care is associated with children's later cognitive and linguistic development. In the UK, the US and in Sweden, children who receive centre-based care over several ages during early childhood have been found to obtain better scores on linguistic and cognitive tests at preschool age with respect to children with fewer experiences of centre-based care (Broberg, Wessels, Lamb, & Hwang, 1997; Hansen, & Hawkes, 2009; Loeb, Bridges, Bassok, Fuller, & Rumberger, 2007; Magnuson, Ruhm, & Waldfogel, 2007; NICHD ECCRN, 2002; 2004; Sylva, Melhuish, Sammons, Siraj-Blatchford, & Taggart, 2004). This association is significant but modest (Belsky, Vandell,

Burchinal, Clarke-Stewart, McCartney, & Owen, 2007; NICHD ECCRN, 2006). Nevertheless, the positive effect of centre-based care in early childhood has been linked to specific characteristics of the care experience, including quality of childcare (Burchinal, Peisner-Feinberg, Bryant, & Clifford, 2000; NICHD ECCRN, 2006; Peisner-Feinberg *et al.*, 2001) and starting centre care between ages 2 and 3 years (Loeb *et al.*, 2007; Sammons *et al.*, 2004). The literature about the effect of the amount of early childcare received showed different results in different countries: in the US, NICHD ECCRN (2006) and Loeb *et al.* (2007) found positive correlations between intensity of day care and cognitive outcomes at late preschool age (around 5 years); in UK, full-time attendance led to no better gains for children at 6 and 7 years than part-time attendance (Sylva *et al.*, 2004); in Germany Landvoigt, Muehler and Pfeiffer (2007) found a negative correlation when cognitive outcomes were assessed between 12 and 14 years of age. However, it should be noted that in the latter study, secondary school track choice was used as a proxy for children's cognitive development and no direct measures were collected.

There is no consensus in the literature concerning the duration of these positive effects of attending centre-based care. In respect to linguistic outcomes, according to some studies performed in the US, the linguistic advantage did not last beyond preschool age (Magnuson *et al.*, 2007; NICHD ECCRN, 2005), whereas in the "Danish Longitudinal Survey of Children" Datta Gupta and Simonsen (2012) found external care at age 3 years to have a positive impact on language ability at age 11 years. In respect to cognitive outcomes, according to Datta Gupta and Simonsen (2012), the cognitive advantage can no longer be detected at the primary school stage, whereas authors from Sweden or US reported that it lasted up to primary school (Broberg *et al.*, 1997; NICHD ECCRN, 2005), disappeared in the first year of primary school (Magnuson *et al.*, 2007) or in sixth grade (about 11-12 years of age; Belsky *et al.*, 2007).

Positive cognitive and linguistic outcomes in children are also affected by other variables, including parental education and immigrant status. In the UK and the US, maternal education is positively associated with cognitive outcomes (NICHD HLB, 1998; NICHD ECCRN, 1997a; Peisner-Feinberg *et al.*, 2001; Sammons *et al.*, 2004): children whose parents have not completed high school display lower levels of achievement in first grade (Magnuson *et al.*, 2007; Sammons *et al.*, 2004). Some authors proposed possible explanation for the positive effect of maternal education (Craig, 2006; Monna & Gauthier, 2008; Sayer, Gauthier, & Furstenberg, 2004): better-educated parents spend more time with their children than parents with a lower level of education; they are more aware of the link between investing time in their children and the latter's future development; they are more likely to be critical of substitutes for parental care; and, last but not least, are more likely to interiorise and implement the social norms and behaviours associated with "involved parenting". Parental education affects the

allocation of time to children, even when national welfare policies, such as income support for families, parental leave, reduced employment hours and provision of centre-based care (Sayer *et al.*, 2004) have been controlled for. The amount of time that mothers allocate to childcare appears to be primarily related to their beliefs about the characteristics of good parenting (Sayer *et al.*, 2004).

Cognitive and linguistic development is also affected by immigrant status. Not just a question of cultural belonging, immigrant status is a condition with specific features related to entering a new social context: for example, separation from one's family, changes in economic status, negative stereotypes and discrimination, language barriers and higher levels of stress (De Feyters & Winsler, 2009). Immigration is affecting a growing number of children in Europe and research on immigrant populations can provide new insights into developmental processes and inform social policy (Garcia Coll *et al.*, 1996; Quintana *et al.*, 2006). In the US, research by De Feyter and Winsler (2009) showed that, among low-income families, non-immigrant pre-schoolers outperformed immigrant pre-schoolers in cognitive and linguistic skills; and interestingly, first generation immigrants appeared to have better cognitive and linguistic skills than second generation children, although this pattern was partly linked with ethnicity (Latinos vs. Blacks). In Canada, 4- to 11-year-old children living in recent immigrant families (15 years or less in the hosting country) had higher levels of school performances, based on parental and teacher report, in respect to children in nonimmigrant and long-standing immigrant families (Georgiades, Boyle, & Duku, 2007). Very often, the immigrant condition combines with other variables that affect children's development, such as poverty status and dual language learning, whereby children acquire both their parents' mother tongue and the language of the host country. When only the mother tongue is spoken in immigrant families, immigrant children outperform US-born children in mathematical skills on school entry; on the other hand, immigrant children whose parents only spoke the host country language, display lower cognitive skills (Winsler *et al.*, 2014). The aim of the present retrospective study was to analyse the role of early childcare experience in the cognitive and linguistic development of preschool and school age children in Italy, exploring how early care interacts with other key variables in the Italian context, namely maternal education and having native versus foreign parents.

Many factors support the value of making a specific study of Italian centre-based care: the well-established tradition of early childhood services in Italy (Bondioli & Mantovani, 1987; Musatti, 1992; Ongari, Schadee, Molina, 1999), the recognised excellence of some of them such as Reggio Children (www.reggiochildren.it; Paoletta, 2013), the innovative nature of certain practices widely implemented in Italian ECECs, such as the *inserimento* ("settling in" phase, Mantovani & Terzi, 1987; Mantovani, Saitta & Bove, 2004), and the emphasis on relationships that characterizes the Italian care model in general (Ongari, 2012). To our knowledge, this study is the first to analyse the effects of early care on the

outcomes of Italian preschool and school-aged children. A recent study conducted in Italy by Del Boca, Pasqua, and Suardi (*Forthcoming*) focused on the relationship between individuals' secondary school achievement and retrospective data about type of care in the first two years of life. Childcare attendance during infancy, the socio-economic status of the families and maternal education appeared to have a positive effect on children grades in high school.

In Italy, early centre-based care is provided through a range of public or private facilities: including *nido* (day nursery) and other types of centre for children (for a description, see Musatti & Picchio, 2010). In 2010/11, 14.0% of Italian children between 0 and 2 years of age were enrolled in centre-based care, with marked differences among the different geographical regions: for instance, in the North, 29.4% of children attended day care in Emilia Romagna and 15.4% in Piemonte, while in the South, percentages varied from 9.6% in Abruzzo to 2.4% in Calabria (Istat, 2012).

Although only some Italian regions have almost met the Barcelona objectives, which were “to provide childcare by 2010 to [...] at least 33% of children under 3 years of age” (European Commission, 2013, page 4), the quality of centre-based care in Italy is generally good, with some local differences among regions (Fabbri, 2007; Fortunati & Parente, 2012; Koslowski *et al.*, 2015). Moreover, Italian law recognises that children have the right to education from birth and that centre-based care bears a dual function: caring for children and helping parents to balance work with family life (Law n. 1044/1971; Scopesi & Viterbori, 2008). Recent legislative proposals emphasize the need to include the “planning of preschool educational services within the framework of general policies in support of children and their families and aimed at fighting poverty and social exclusion” (Parliamentary Bill n. 1260, 2014, p. 3, authors' translation).

Thus, comparing the effect of centre-based and home-based care in the Italian context can provide novel information about the impact of day-care. Given that type of care is only one of many factors influencing children's development, the current study also examined two of the other important variables mentioned above: maternal education and immigrant status.

In light of the literature on the topic, we predicted four main results: (1) that the choice of type of care would vary as a function of maternal education: specifically, that centre-based care would be mainly chosen by more highly educated mothers; (2) that the choice of type of care would vary as a function of parental origin: specifically, that centre-based care would be mainly chosen by native Italian parents; (3) that both a high level of maternal education and centre-based care would have a positive effect on children's outcomes; (4) that having foreign-born parents would have a negative effect on children's linguistic outcome (receptive language). In light of the debate about the stability of centre-based care

effects, all our analyses were carried out on both pre-school and primary school subsamples in order to explore the duration of any type-of-care effects.

Method

Participants

The sample comprised 175 three- to ten-year-old children, from a large Northern Italian city (see *Table 1*). Data were collected between 2009 and 2012. Children were recruited at preschools and primary schools, and in a few cases via personal contacts. All families provided written informed consent for their child's participation in the research. Four additional children (all boys, average age = 94 months) were excluded from the analysis, because of errors in the procedure. Parents and teachers reported that all children spoke Italian and were not affected by medical, psychological or developmental disorders. Italy was the birthplace of 98.9% of the children ($N = 173$), while 1.1% had been born in other European countries ($N = 2$).

Table 1. Description and comparison of the samples

Variable	Total	Preschoolers		Pupils		Chi ² (two-tailed)
	N (%)	N (%)		N (%)		
Sample size	175	94		81		
Girls	85 (48.6)	50 (53.2)		35 (43.2)		.19, <i>df</i> = 1, <i>p</i> = .225
Center-based care	79 (45.1)	46 (48.9)		33 (40.7)		1.18, <i>df</i> = 1, <i>p</i> = .291
Maternal Education						
Lower secondary school	90 (51.4)	39 (41.5)		51 (63.0)		
Upper secondary school	65 (37.2)	44 (46.8)		21 (25.9)		9.02, <i>df</i> = 2, <i>p</i> = .011
Higher education	20 (11.4)	11 (11.7)		9 (11.1)		
Parental Origins						
Both Italians	129 (73.8)	73 (79.3)		56 (69.1)		
One foreign	24 (13.7)	9 (9.8)		15 (18.5)		3.05, <i>df</i> = 2, <i>p</i> = .217
Both foreign	20 (11.4)	10 (10.9)		10 (12.3)		
	M (SD)	M (SD)	range	M (SD)	range	t-test (two-tailed)
Child age (months)		38.5 (8.3)	39-69	89.0 (17.4)	70-124	
IQ		101.1 (12.5)	73-141	98.4 (14.6)	73-133	<i>t</i> (173) = 1.33, <i>p</i> = .183
VQ		80.7 (17.4)	64-130	90.7 (15.9)	64-129	<i>t</i> (173) = -4.52, <i>p</i> < .001

Seventy-nine of the children had attended centre-based care and 96 children had received exclusive home-based care (see *Table 1*) in their early years: of the latter category, 15 children had been in exclusive maternal care (15.6%), 56 had been looked after by other family members (usually grandparents, in few cases aunts; 58.3%), 2 children received care from babysitters who were not relatives (2.1%); for 23 children, the exact type of home-based care was not specified (24%).

With regard to parental origins, 129 children had two native parents (73.8%), 24 had one foreign-born parent (13.7%) and 20 had two foreign-born parents (11.4%), whereas for 2 children this information was not available (1.1%). In our sample, the percentage of children with two foreign-born parents is slightly higher than in the Italian population: between 2009 and 2012 this percentage went from 8.1% to 9.2% in kindergartens and from 8.7% to 9.5% in primary schools (Miur–Ufficio di Statistica, 2013).

In terms of education, in the overall sample 51.4% of mothers had completed lower secondary school (N = 90), 37.2% held an upper secondary school diploma (N = 65) and 11.4% had a university qualification (N = 20). Overall, the sample displayed a lower level of educational achievement than the Italian population between 25 and 64 years of age in 2011, in which 44% had completed lower secondary education, 41% upper secondary education and 15% third level education (OECD, 2014). To investigate the stability of the child-care effect, the sample was divided into two subgroups, preschoolers and primary students. *Table 1* describes and compares the two subsamples.

Measures

Tests. The Leiter-R (Roid & Miller, 1997; Italian version: 2002) was used to assess non-verbal IQ; the *Peabody Picture Vocabulary Test-R* (Dunn & Dunn, 1981), in its Italian version (Stella, Pizzoli, & Tressoldi, 2000), was used to assess receptive language abilities. The two tests were administered at kindergarten or at school, at two separate sessions within a month of each other; each session took about 15-30 minutes depending on the test and on the child's age.

Socio-demographic questionnaire. Parents were asked to complete a questionnaire on their socio-demographic background, which assessed both parent-related characteristics (place of birth, level of education, first language spoken at home) and child-related characteristics (birthplace, gender, presence of siblings, type of childcare before 3 years of life).

For each child, parents' place of birth was coded as follows: (0) both parents native Italians, (1) one native Italian parent and one foreign-born parent and (2) both parents foreign-born.

Parents' educational level was coded following the Italian school system: the label "lower secondary education" was assigned when subjects had attended at least 8 years of compulsory education; "upper secondary education" when they had attended about 13 years of school and "higher education" when they had attended at least 16 years of school/university, with bachelor's, master's and doctoral degrees collapsed together into a single category.

Data Analysis

Because there was a different number of children in each of the two conditions (maternal education and parental origin), we performed non-parametric exact tests, Mann-Whitney for comparing two independent samples and Kruskal-Wallis tests for three independent samples. The Bonferroni correction was used to establish the acceptable level of significance for comparing pairs of subgroups via multiple comparisons.

Analyses were first carried out on the overall sample, and then on the two subsamples of pre-schoolers and primary school children, in order to investigate the stability of the effect of type of care over time.

Normality tests

The observed IQ score ranged from 73 to 141 ($M = 99.84$, $SD = 13.54$), and the VQ score from 64 to 130 ($M = 85.32$, $SD = 15.21$). Preliminary descriptive analyses confirmed that data distribution was normal for both IQ and VQ (Kolmogorov-Smirnov tests: IQ: skewness = .35, kurtosis = -.01, $p > .10$; VQ: skewness = .48, kurtosis = -.35, $p > .10$).

The average score of the VQ was low; unfortunately, the Italian manual of the PPVT did not report any information about the sociodemographic characteristics of the standardization sample, thus it is impossible to make a comparison for explaining our result. The PPVT was chosen because it is a widely spread tool, with several international translations and standardizations.

Results

Type of care chosen and family characteristics

Maternal education affected the type of care chosen: 62% of mothers with lower secondary education and 52% with upper secondary education chose home-based care, whereas 70% of university-educated mothers opted for centre-based care (Kruskal-Wallis Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method, $\chi^2 = 7.09$, $p < .05$). Two groups were significantly different to one another: mothers with lower secondary

education and those with university degrees (Mann-Whitney Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method, $U = 610.00$, $p < .015$).

Parental origin did not affect the type of care chosen: 45% of native Italian parents, 50% of mixed parents and 35% of foreign-born parents chose centre-based care but these differences were not statistically significant (Kruskal-Wallis Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method, $\chi^2 = 1.03$, $p = .605$).

Single effects of type of care, maternal education and parental origin

Type of care did not affect linguistic and cognitive outcomes. The IQ of children who had been in home-based care in early childhood did not differ from that of children who had received centre-based care (Mann-Whitney Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method, for total sample: $U = 3596.00$, $p = .559$; see Table 2, Column 4). The same pattern of results was observed for VQ (Mann-Whitney Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method, for total sample: $U = 3437.50$, $p = .286$; see Table 3, Column 4).

Both IQ and VQ rose significantly with maternal education (see Table 2, Row 3 and Table 3, Row 3). Both the IQ and VQ of children whose mothers had completed lower secondary education were significantly lower than those of children whose mothers held a university degree (see Table 2, Row 3 and Table 3, Row 3); the significant difference between mothers with upper secondary education and a university-level qualification concerned only IQ (see Table 2, Row 3).

Parental origin affected neither IQ (see Table 4, Row 3) nor VQ (see Table 5, Row 3): no differences emerged among children raised by native Italian, mixed or foreign-born parental couples.

Table 2. Mean (SD) IQ scores by type of care and maternal education

Type of care	Maternal education								χ^2 (*)	p
	1		2		3		4			
	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)		
1 Home-based	56	95.9 (11.9) ^a	34	100.8 (12.7) ^b	6	120.2 (10.3) ^{a, b}	96	99.2 (13.3)	2.80	< .001
2 Centre-based	34	99.2 (14.3)	31	99.8 (12.9)	14	106.1 (14.2)	79	100.7 (13.8)	14.38	.247
3 Total	90	97.2 (12.9) ^a	65	100.3 (12.7) ^b	20	110.3 (14.5) ^{a, b}	175	99.8 (13.5)	13.63	.001

The same superscript shows values that are significantly different (Mann-Whitney Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method): ^a $p < .001$ and ^b $p < .01$. (*) Kruskal-Wallis Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method.

Joint effect of type of care and maternal education

When type of care and maternal education were examined together, an effect of type of care emerged, in interaction with maternal education. Specifically, the IQ and VQ of children in home-based care increased as a function of maternal education (see *Table 2*, Row 1 and *Table 3*, Row 1 respectively), whereas those of children who attended day care did not vary with maternal education (see *Table 2*, Row 2 and *Table 3*, Row 2 respectively).

Table 3. Mean (SD) VQ scores by type of care and maternal education

Type of care	Maternal education								χ^2 (*)	p
	1		2		3		4			
	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)		
1 Home-based	56	81.5 (14.1) ^a	34	85.6 (15.8) ^b	6	102.8 (13.1) ^{a, b}	96	84.3 (15.4)	9.67	.005
2 Centre-based	34	85.1 (16.0)	31	86.2 (14.4)	14	90.9 (13.4)	79	86.6 (14.9)	2.01	.368
3 Total	90	82.9 (14.9) ^a	65	85.9 (15.0)	20	94.5 (14.1) ^a	175	85.3 (15.2)	10.37	.005

The same superscript shows values that are significantly different (Mann-Whitney Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method): ^a $p < .01$ and ^b $p < .05$. (*) Kruskal-Wallis Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method

Joint effect of type of care and parental origin

Given that maternal education affected children’s cognitive and linguistic outcomes, we conducted a separate analysis to ensure that the educational level of mothers in native, mixed and foreign-born couples did not significantly differ (Kruskal-Wallis Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method, $\chi^2 = .34$, $p = .853$).

Table 4. Mean (SD) IQ scores by type of care and parental origin

Type of care	Parental origins								χ^2 (*)	p
	1		2		3		4			
	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)		
1 Home-based	71	99.8 (13.4)	12	96.3 (15.9)	13	98.5 (11.0)	96	99.2 (13.3)	.28	.871
2 Centre-based	58	102.9 (14.3)	12	95.2 (9.0)	7	92.4 (13.5)	77	100.8 (14.0)	4.97	.079
3 Total	129	101.2 (13.9)	24	95.7 (12.6)	20	96.4 (11.9)	173	99.9 (13.6)	4.19	.123

(*) Kruskal-Wallis Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method.

Type of care partly interacted with parental origin: cognitive outcomes did not vary as a function of parental origin among children who had been in home-based

versus centre-based care in early childhood (see *Table 4*, Rows 1 and 2), whereas differences emerged in relation to VQ. Specifically, children with two foreign parents who had attended day care displayed significantly lower receptive language ability than children with two native or “mixed” parents (see *Table 5*, Row 1 and 2). Among children in home-based care, this difference was not significant.

Table 5. Mean (SD) VQ by type of care and parental origins

Type of care	Parental origins								χ^2 (*)	p
	1		2		3		4			
	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)		
1 Home-based	71	84.7 (16.2)	12	85.3 (14.9)	13	81.5 (12.1)	96	84.3 (15.4)	1.18	.559
2 Centre-based	58	87.3 (15.1) ^a	12	89.6 (14.9)	7	73.7 (9.4) ^a	77	86.5 (15.1)	6.37	.038
3 Total	129	85.9 (15.7)	24	87.4 (14.7)	20	78.8 (11.6)	173	85.3 (15.3)	4.09	.129

The same superscript shows values that are significantly different (Mann-Whitney Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method): ^a $p < .05$. (*) Kruskal-Wallis Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method.

Differences from preschool to school age

We repeated all the analyses conducted on the total sample data, on the two subgroups of pre-schoolers and primary school students, to verify whether the effects varied as a function of children’s age. We only report the results that differed from those of the overall sample.

Maternal education only affected choice of type of care in the preschooler subsample: 61.5% of mothers with lower secondary education and 50.0% with upper secondary education had chosen home-based care for their children’s early years, whereas 81.8% of university-educated mothers had opted for centre-based care (Kruskal-Wallis Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method, $\chi^2 = 6.42$, $p < .05$). In the primary student subsample, a similar trend emerged: mothers with lower secondary education or upper secondary education were more likely to have chosen home-based care (62.7% and 57.1% respectively), whereas higher educated mothers were more likely to have opted for centre-based care (55.6%), but these differences were not significant (Kruskal-Wallis Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method, $\chi^2 = 1.10$, $p = .595$).

The effect of maternal education on both cognitive and linguistic outcomes detected in the total sample, was present for preschoolers but not for primary students (see *Table 6* and 7).

Table 6. Mean (SD) IQ scores by age group and maternal education

	Maternal education								χ^2 (*)	p
	1		2		3		4			
	Lower secondary	Upper secondary	Higher education	Total	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)		
Sample	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)		
Pre-schoolers	39	99.4 (12.5) ^b	44	99.7 (11.4) ^c	11	112.6 (12.5) ^{b, c}	94	101.1 (12.5)	11.00	.004
Pupils	51	95.4 (13.0)	21	101.6 (15.3)	9	107.4 (17.4)	81	98.4 (14.6)	4.80	.089
Total	90	97.2 (12.9) ^a	65	100.3 (12.7) ^b	20	110.3 (14.5) ^{a, b}	175	99.8 (13.5)	13.63	.001

The same superscript shows values that are significantly different (Mann-Whitney Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method): ^a $p < .001$ and ^{b, c} $p < .01$. (*) Kruskal-Wallis Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method.

Table 7. Mean (SD) VQ scores by age group and maternal education

	Maternal education								χ^2 (*)	p
	1		2		3		4			
	Lower secondary	Upper secondary	Higher education	Total	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)		
Sample	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)		
1 Pre-schoolers	39	76.6 (12.6) ^b	44	81.9 (11.9)	11	90.2 (13.1) ^b	94	80.7 (12.9)	11.61	.002
2 Pupils	51	87.6 (14.8)	21	94.3 (17.6)	9	99.7 (14.2)	81	90.7 (15.9)	5.37	.068
3 Total	90	82.9 (14.9) ^a	65	85.9 (15.0)	20	94.5 (14.1) ^a	175	85.3 (15.2)	10.37	.004

The same superscript shows values that are significantly different (Mann-Whitney Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method): ^a $p < .005$ and ^b $p < .01$. (*) Kruskal-Wallis Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method.

Nevertheless, in relation to IQ only, the cognitive scores of primary students who had been in home-based care were positively associated with higher maternal education (see Table 8, Row 1), whereas those of primary school children who had received centre-based care were not. More specifically, while the Kruskal-Wallis test identified a significant effect of maternal education, the Mann-Whitney test did not indicate any significant difference between the sub-groups (see Table 8, Row 2). The VQ of primary pupils did not differ as a function of maternal education regardless of whether they had received centre-based care home-based early childhood care.

Table 8. Mean (SD) IQ scores of primary students by type of care and maternal education

Type of care	Maternal education								χ^2 (*)	p
	1		2		3		4			
	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)		
1 Home-based	32	94.2 (13.3) ^a	12	95.1 (15.0) ^b	4	120.8 (13.2) ^{a, b}	48	96.6 (15.3)	7.64	.017
2 Centre-based	19	97.5 (12.5)	9	110.3 (11.3)	5	96.8 (12.6)	33	96.8 (12.6)	5.84	.047
3 Total	51	95.4 (13.0)	21	101.6 (15.3)	9	107.4 (14.6)	81	98.4 (14.6)	4.80	.087

The same superscript shows values that are significantly different (Mann-Whitney Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method): ^a $p < .05$ and ^b $p < .05$. (*) Kruskal-Wallis Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method.

Finally, the pre-schoolers' sample display a pattern of results that was very similar to that of the total sample, with the exception of the joint effect of parental origin and type of care on linguistic outcomes. In relation to the groups of children who were in centre-based care in early childhood, in the total sample the VQ of children with two native parents was significantly higher than that of children with two foreign-born parents; this also held for the primary student sub-sample (see Table 9 and 10), but not for the pre-schooler group (see Table 10, Row 1).

Table 9. Mean (SD) VQ scores of primary students by type of care and parents' origins

Type of care	Parental origins								χ^2 (*)	p
	1		2		3		4			
	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)		
1 Home-based	34	89.5 (18.1)	8	92.6 (11.71)	6	85.5 (15.3)	48	89.5 (16.7)	.80	.670
2 Centre-based	22	94.9 (13.9) ^a	7	95.7 (12.8)	4	73.0 (10.0) ^a	33	92.4 (14.8)	6.92	.024
3 Total	56	91.6 (16.6)	15	94.1 (11.9)	10	80.5 (14.3)	81	90.7 (15.9)	5.21	.075

The same superscript shows values that are significantly different (Mann-Whitney Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method): ^a $p < .01$. (*) Kruskal-Wallis Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method.

Table 10. Mean (SD) VQ scores of children in centre-based care by age group and parental origin

Sample	Parental origins								χ^2 (*)	p
	1		2		3		4			
	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)	N	Mean (SD)		
Pre-schoolers	36	82.7 (14.1)	5	81.0 (14.5)	3	74.7 (10.5)	44	82.0 (13.9)	.97	.644
Pupils	22	94.9 (13.9) ^a	7	95.7 (12.8)	4	73.0 (10.0) ^a	33	92.4 (14.8)	9.92	.025
Total	58	87.3 (15.1) ^b	12	89.6 (14.9)	7	73.7 (9.4) ^b	77	86.5 (15.1)	6.37	.043

The same superscript shows values that are significantly different (Mann-Whitney Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method): ^a $p < .01$ and ^b $p < .05$). (*) Kruskal-Wallis Exact Test, Monte Carlo Method.

Discussion

The aim of this study was to contribute to the debate about the effects of early childcare, maternal education and parental origin on children's outcomes as observed at pre-school and primary school ages, by analysing preliminary Italian data.

In keeping with the literature, our first and second hypotheses stated that centre-based care would be mainly chosen by highly educated mothers and native parents. The results partly confirmed these hypotheses: in our study, highly educated mothers were more likely to choose centre-based care than were mothers with a lower level education, but this effect was detected in the preschool sample only. On the contrary, the percentage of foreign-born parents who opted for centre-based care was not significantly different from the percentage of mixed or native parents. It is likely that this finding was influenced by the way in which access to day care is regulated in the city in which the data were collected: specifically, local regulations are designed to facilitate access to public care for families at risk, for example by reducing fees for low-income units. This could be interpreted as an example of an efficient inclusion policy.

Our third hypothesis stated that maternal education would be positively linked to children's outcomes and this was confirmed for preschoolers only. In the preschoolers' subsample, the VQ of children with university-educated mothers was significantly higher than that of children whose mothers had only completed lower secondary education; the same difference was found for IQ while the children of mothers with a university-level qualification also obtained higher IQ scores than their peers whose mothers had completed upper secondary education. Nevertheless, in the primary students subsample, these differences were not significant. Given that the measure of VQ was based on the amount of receptive

vocabulary, it is possible that the primary school education process had helped children to fill this gap. The third hypothesis also stated that centre-based care would have a positive effect on children's outcomes; however, type of care per se was not found to have any effect on either cognitive or linguistic outcomes.

In contrast, when the joint effect of type of care and maternal education was examined in relation to the total sample, we found out that the IQ and VQ of children who had been in home-based care increased with level of maternal education, whereas the IQ and VQ of children who had received centre-based care did not. This result was replicated in relation to the IQ of primary school students who had attended day care facilities in early childhood. Thus, professional care appeared to play a protective role for children with less educated mothers. It should be acknowledged that, in the current study, no information was collected concerning the quality of childcare facilities or parental styles, and our sample contained a relatively small number of children with university-educated mothers. It follows that the results should be interpreted with caution. Nevertheless, these findings suggest a positive effect of centre-based care, which should be taken into account when designing policies for the inclusion of children whose parents are poorly educated.

According to our fourth hypothesis, children with two foreign parents would obtain poorer linguistic outcomes. In general, parental origin – with parental couples categorized as *both native*, *mixed* or *both foreign* – did not affect children's linguistic and cognitive outcomes. However, a joint effect of parental origin and type of care emerged in the primary student subsample: specifically, the VQ of children with two foreign parents who had attended day care services in early childhood was significantly lower than the VQ of children with two native or mixed parents. Centre-based care should be designed to help the children of foreign-born parents to acquire the host country language and this aspect should be addressed at a policy level.

In sum, when the single effects of type of care, maternal education and parental origin on children's outcomes were analysed, only differences linked to maternal education emerged. Nevertheless, on exploration of the interactions among these variables, centre-based care appeared to play a protective role with respect to maternal education: in fact, differences due to maternal education – in terms of both verbal and cognitive performance – were evident in children who had received their early care exclusively in the home, but not in children whose early care had been centre-based, in respect to both. On the contrary, home-based care appeared to play a protective role with respect to parental origins: the linguistic performance of children with two foreign parents was more advanced if they had been cared for at home during their early years.

Our study displays some limitations. The outcomes of pre-schooler and primary pupil subsamples may have been exposed to a cohort effect and actually differed

in terms of the distribution of maternal education and of mean VQ. Moreover, the data concerning the type of early care received in the first three years of life was collected retrospectively. Future research should also take into account the quality of care, by collecting indicators of both parental interactional style and day care organization. Some features of our sample limited the generalisability of the results: first, children's IQ was normal but verbal-Q was lower than expected; since no socio-demographic information about the PPVT-R Italian standardization sample were available, it was impossible to precisely address the reasons for this low verbal-Q. Second, the percentage of children with two foreign-born parents was slightly higher than in the Italian population and, finally, mothers' educational achievement were slightly lower than in the Italian population.

Our study could help to inform policy planning and implementation in the Italian context: it seems crucial to design educational intervention and train professionals to better support children's linguistic development from the early years of life and day-care and nursery schools are the best candidates for providing such support (Molina, Marotta & Bulgarelli, 2016; Scopesi & Viterbori, 2008). Children with two foreign parents stand to gain the most from this kind of targeted intervention. Moreover, given the positive impact of maternal university education on the outcomes of children cared for at home, it could be of value to reflect on the stimulation that educational services provide as a whole: the esthetical quality of the environment and materials, environmental and organizational features that limit stressful noises and crowding, richness of cultural initiatives, opportunities for the child to interact freely and independently with the environment and toys, for instance. Finally, when children have poor linguistic competence it is critical to offer them the opportunity to express themselves through movement, manipulation and artistic expression in order to foster feelings of self-competence.

Acknowledgements

The first author acknowledges financial support from Collegio Carlo Alberto and from the European Union's Seventh Framework Programme (FP7/2007-2013) under grant agreement no. 320116 for the research project FamiliesAndSocieties. Thank you to the psychology undergraduate students for help with the collection of the data. We are especially grateful to the Italian kindergarten and school staff for their support and to the parents and children who participated in the study.

References

- Belsky, J., Vandell, D. L., Burchinal, M., Clarke-Stewart, K. A., McCartney, K., & Owen, M. T. (2007). Are There Long-Term Effects of Early Child Care?. *Child development*, 78(2), 681-701.
- Bondioli, A., & Mantovani, S. (1987). *Manuale critico dell'asilo nido* [Critic handbook of day care centres]. Milano (I): Franco Angeli.
- Broberg, A.G., Wessels, H., Lamb, M. E., & Hwang, C. P. (1997). Effects of day care on the development of cognitive abilities in 8-year-olds: A longitudinal study. *Developmental Psychology*, 33(1), 62-69.
- Burchinal, M. R., Peisner-Feinberg, E., Bryant, D. M., & Clifford, R. (2000). Children's social and cognitive development and child-care quality: Testing for differential associations related to poverty, gender, or ethnicity. *Applied Developmental Science*, 4(3), 149-165.
- Craig, L. (2006). Does father care mean fathers share? A comparison of how mothers and fathers in intact families spend time with children. *Gender & Society*, 20(2), 259-281.
- Datta Gupta, N., & Simonsen, M. (2012). The effects of type of non-parental child care on pre-teen skills and risky behavior. *Economics Letters*, 116(3), 622-625.
- De Feyter, J.J., & Winsler, A. (2009). The early developmental competencies and school readiness of low-income, immigrant children: Influences of generation, race/ethnicity, and national origins. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*, 24(4), 411-431.
- Del Boca, D., Locatelli, M., & Vuri, D. (2005). Child-care choices by working mothers: The case of Italy. *Review of Economics of the Household*, 3(4), 453-477.
- Del Boca, D. Pasqua, S., & Suardi, S. (Forthcoming). Childcare, maternal employment, and children's school outcomes. An analysis of Italian data. *European Journal of Population*. Retrieved from: <http://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10680-015-9370-0> (February 2016).
- Dunn, L. M., & Dunn, L. M. (1981). *P.P.V.T.-R.: Peabody Peacture Vocabulary Test-Revised*. Circle Pines, MN: American Guidance Service.
- European Commission (2013). Barcelona objectives. The development of childcare facilities for young children in Europe with a view to sustainable and inclusive growth. Luxembourg (B): Publications Office of the European Union. Retrieved from: http://ec.europa.eu/justice/gender-equality/files/documents/130531_barcelona_en.pdf (April 2015).
- Fabbri, M. (2007). I nidi d'infanzia fra storia e innovazione: Lavoro di cura e scenari istituzionali [Day care centres between history and innovation: care work and institutions]. *Ricerche di pedagogia e didattica*, 2(2), 1000-1008.
- Fortunati, A., & Parente, M. (2012). Strategie regionali e locali per la regolazione dei servizi socio-educativi. Evoluzione normativa, standard autorizzativi e accreditamento [Local strategies for the regulation of day care centres. Law evolution and standards for authorization and accreditation]. *Welfare Oggi*, 18(6), 11-16.
- Garcia Coll, C. G., Crnic, K., Lamberty, G., Wasik, B. H., Jenkins, R., Garcia, H. V., & McAdoo, H. P. (1996). An integrative model for the study of developmental competencies in minority children. *Child development*, 67(5), 1891-1914.

- Georgiades, K., Boyle, M. H., & Duku, E. (2007). Contextual influences on children's mental health and school performance: The moderating effects of family immigrant status. *Child development*, 78(5), 1572-1591.
- Grogan, K. E. (2012). Parents' choice of pre-kindergarten: the interaction of parent, child and contextual factors. *Early Child Development and Care*, 182(10), 1265-1287.
- Hansen, K., & Hawkes, D. (2009). Early childcare and child development. *Journal of Social Policy*, 38(02), 211-239.
- Istat (2012). L'offerta comunale di asili nido e altri servizi educativi per la prima infanzia. Anno scolastico 2010/2011 [Municipal supply of day care and other services for early infancy. Academic year 2010/2011]. Retrieved from: <http://www.istat.it/it/archivio/65371> (January 2015).
- Kahn, J. M., & Greenberg, J. P. (2010). Factors predicting early childhood education and care use by immigrant families. *Social Science Research*, 39(4), 642-651.
- Kim, J., & Fram, M.S. (2009). Profiles of choice: Parents' patterns of priority in child care decision-making. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*, 24(1), 77-91.
- Koslowski, A., McLean, C., & Naumann, I. K. (2015). *Report on Incentive Structures of Parents' Use of Particular Childcare Forms*. Families and Societies project. Retrieved from: <http://www.familiesandsocieties.eu/wp-content/uploads/2015/04/WP35KoslowskiEtAl2015.pdf> (February 2016).
- Krapf, S. (2014). Who uses public childcare for 2-year-old children? Coherent family policies and usage patterns in Sweden, Finland and Western Germany. *International Journal of Social Welfare*, 23(1), 25-40.
- Landvoigt, T., Muehler, G., & Pfeiffer, F. (2007). Duration and intensity of kindergarten attendance and secondary school track choice (No. 07-051). *ZEW-Centre for European Economic Research Discussion Paper*.
- Law 1044 (1971). Piano quinquennale per l'istituzione di asili-nido comunali con il concorso dello Stato [Quinquennial plan for the establishment of municipal nursery school with the involvement of the State government]. Retrieved from: <http://www.normattiva.it/uri-res/N2Ls?urn:nir:stato:legge:1971-12-06;1044> (April 2015).
- Loeb, S., Bridges, M., Bassok, D., Fuller, B., & Rumberger, R. W. (2007). How much is too much? The influence of preschool centers on children's social and cognitive development. *Economics of Education Review*, 26(1), 52-66.
- Magnuson, K.A., Ruhm, C., & Waldfogel, J. (2007). Does prekindergarten improve school preparation and performance?. *Economics of Education Review*, 26(1), 33-51.
- Mamolo, M., Coppola, L., & Di Cesare, M. (2011). Formal childcare use and household socio-economic profile in France, Italy, Spain and UK. *Population Review*, 50(1), Sociological Demography Press. Retrieved from: <http://muse.jhu.edu/journals/prv/summary/v050/50.1.mamolo.html> (November, 2015).
- Mantovani, S., & Terzi, N. (1987). L'inserimento. In: A. Bondioli, A. & S. Mantovani (Eds.) *Manuale critico dell'asilo nido* [Critic handbook of day care centres]. Milano (I): Franco Angeli.
- Mantovani, S., Saitta, L. R., & Bove, C. (2004). *Attaccamento e inserimento. Stili e storie delle relazioni al nido* [Attachment and settling in phase. Styles and stories about the relationships in early child care services]. Milano (I): Franco Angeli.

- Miller, P., Votruba-Drzal, E., & Coley, R. L. (2013). Predictors of early care and education type among preschool-aged children in immigrant families: The role of region of origin and characteristics of the immigrant experience. *Children and Youth Services Review, 35*(9), 1342-1355.
- Miller, P., Votruba-Drzal, E., Coley, R. L., & Koury, A. S. (2014). Immigrant families' use of early childcare: Predictors of care type. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly, 29*(4), 484-498.
- Miur-Ufficio di Statistica (2013). *Gli alunni stranieri nel Sistema scolastico italiano* (Foreign pupils in the Italian school system). Retrieved from: http://www.istruzione.it/allegati/2014/Notiziario_Stranieri_13_14.pdf (January 2015).
- Molina, P., Marotta, M., & Bulgarelli, D. (2016). Observation-projet: a professional tool for caregivers. Two experiences in Italian day-care settings. *European Early Childhood Education Research Journal, 24*(1), 86-102.
- Monna, B., & Gauthier, A. H. (2008). A review of the literature on the social and economic determinants of parental time. *Journal of Family and Economic Issues, 29*(4), 634-653.
- Morgan, K. J., & Zippel, K. (2003). Paid to care: The origins and effects of care leave policies in Western Europe. *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State & Society, 10*(1), 49-85.
- Musatti, T. (1992). *La giornata del mio bambino*. Bologna (I): Il Mulino.
- Musatti, T., & Picchio, M. (2010). Early education in Italy: Research and practice. *International Journal of Early Childhood, 42*(2), 141-153.
- NICHD Early Child Care Research Network. (1997a). The effects of infant child care on infant-mother attachment security: Results of the NICHD Study of Early Child Care. *Child Development, 68*, 860-879.
- NICHD Early Child Care Research Network. (1997b). Familial factors associated with the characteristics of nonmaternal care for infants. *Journal of Marriage and the Family, 59*, 389-408.
- NICHD Human Learning Branch (1998). Relations between family predictors and child outcomes: are they weaker for children in child care?. *Developmental Psychology, 34*(5), 1119-1128.
- NICHD Early Child Care Research Network. (2002). Early child care and children's development prior to school entry: Results from the NICHD Study of Early Child Care. *American Educational Research Journal, 39*(1), 133-164.
- NICHD Early Child Care Research Network. (2004). Type of child care and children's development at 54 months. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly, 19*(2), 203-230.
- NICHD Early Child Care Research Network. (2005). Early child care and children's development in the primary grades: Follow-up results from the NICHD study of early child care. *American Educational Research Journal, 42*(3), 537-570.
- NICHD Early Child Care Research Network. (2006). Child-care effect sizes for the NICHD study of early child care and youth development. *American Psychologist, 61*(2), 99-116.
- OECD (2014). *Education at a Glance 2014: OECD Indicators*. OECD Publishing. Retrieved from: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/eag-2014-en> (January 2015)
- Ongari, B. (2012). *Prospettive di ricerca e spunti per la formazione [Research perspectives and cues for training]*. Trento (I): Erickson.

- Ongari, B., Schadee, H.M., & Molina, P. (1999). Un'analisi strutturale della rappresentazione sociale della professione di educatrice di nido [A structural analysis of the social representation of the profession of educators in early child care]. *Età Evolutiva*, 63, 73-80.
- Paoletta, F. (2013). La pedagogia di Loris Malaguzzi. Per una storia del Reggio Emilia approach [The pedagogy of Malaguzzi. The Reggio Emilia approach]. *Rivista sperimentale di freniatria*. 137(1), 1-18.
- Parliamentary Bill n. 1260, XVII Legislature (2014). Disposizioni in materia di sistema integrato di educazione e istruzione dalla nascita fino ai sei anni e del diritto delle bambine e dei bambini alle pari opportunità di apprendimento [Disposals in the matter of integrated system of education and teaching from birth up to six years and of the right of children to equal opportunities of learning]. Retrieved from: <https://www.senato.it/service/PDF/PDFServer/DF/301466.pdf> (April 2015)
- Peisner-Feinberg, E. S., Burchinal, M. R., Clifford, R. M., Culkin, M. L., Howes, C., Kagan, S. L., & Yazejian, N. (2001). The relation of preschool child-care quality to children's cognitive and social developmental trajectories through second grade. *Child Development*, 72(5), 1534-1553.
- Quintana, S. M., Aboud, F. E., Chao, R. K., Contreras-Grau, J., Cross, W. E., Hudley, C., ... & Vietze, D. L. (2006). Race, ethnicity, and culture in child development: Contemporary research and future directions. *Child Development*, 77(5), 1129-1141.
- Roid, G.H., & Miller L.J. (2002). *Leiter-R: Leiter international Performance Scale-Revised* (M. Sabbadini & F. Galloni, Trad.). Firenze: Giunti OS.
- Sammons, P., Elliot, K., Sylva, K., Melhuish, E., Siraj-Blatchford, I., & Taggart, B. (2004). The impact of pre-school on young children's cognitive attainments at entry to reception. *British Educational Research Journal*, 30(5), 691-712.
- Sayer, L. C., Gauthier, A. H., & Furstenberg, F.F. (2004). Educational differences in parents' time with children: Cross-national variations. *Journal of Marriage and Family*, 66(5), 1152-1169.
- Scopesi, A. & Viterbori, P. (2008). *Istituzioni educative prescolari e sviluppo del linguaggio* [Preschool educational services and language development]. Roma: Carocci Editore.
- Stella, G., Pizzoli, C., & P. E. Tressoldi (2000). *P.P.V.T.-R.: Peabody Peacture Vocabulary Test-Revised*. Torino: Omega.
- Sylva, K., Melhuish, E., Sammons, P., Siraj-Blatchford, I., & Taggart, B. (2004). *The effective provision of pre-school education (EPPE) project: Findings from the Early Primary Years* (SSU/SF/2004/02). Department for Education and Skills-SureStart. Retrieve from: [http://www.ioe.ac.uk/RB_Findings_from_early_primary\(1\).pdf](http://www.ioe.ac.uk/RB_Findings_from_early_primary(1).pdf) (November, 2015)
- Sylva, K., Stein, A., Leach, P., Barnes, J., & Malmberg, L.E. (2007). Family and child factors related to the use of non-maternal infant care: An English study. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*, 22(1), 118-136.
- Turney, K., & Kao, G. (2009). Pre-kindergarten child care and behavioral outcomes among children of immigrants. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*, 24(4), 432-444.

- Vandenbroeck, M., De Visscher, S., Van Nuffel, K., & Ferla, J. (2008). Mothers' search for infant child care: the dynamic relationship between availability and desirability in a continental European welfare state. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly, 23*(2), 245-258.
- Winsler, A., Burchinal, M. R., Tien, H. C., Peisner-Feinberg, E., Espinosa, L., Castro, D. C., ... & De Feyter, J. (2014). Early development among dual language learners: The roles of language use at home, maternal immigration, country of origin, and socio-demographic variables. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*. doi:10.1016/j.ecresq.2014.02.008
- Zachrisson, H. D., Janson, H., & Nérde, A. (2013). Predicting early center care utilization in a context of universal access. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly, 28*(1), 74-82.